## Geoelectrics

## Introduction

Electrical resistivity tomography (ERT) is a geophysical method aiming at the imaging of the resistivity of soil and rocks in the subsurface by electrical measurements taken at electrodes at the surface or inside boreholes. The method has its roots in the vertical electrical sounding techniques (VES) (Ref. 1) and exploits the fact that resistivity varies over several orders of magnitude for various types of rock, in particular depending on the conductivity and quantity of fluids and minerals contained in them.

ERT is today routinely applied to investigate targets from diverse applications such as mining, oil and gas exploration, groundwater, waste disposal, landslides, dams and embankments, geological faults, and volcanoes and archeology, to name just a few. The method is closely related to electrical impedance tomography (EIT) as it is used in medical imaging or nondestructive material testing. One specialty of geophysical ERT is however that the boundaries of the target region are typically far away from the measurement system, virtually at infinity.

Typically, the physical domain where the geoelectrical survey takes place is unbounded to the sides and the bottom. For this reason, one needs to care of modeling infinity at the computational domains.

A single geoelectrical measurement involves the injection of a current $I$ through two point-like electrodes, typically called $C_{1}$ and $C_{2}$, and the measurements of the potential difference $V_{12}$ between two other electrodes $\left(P_{1}\right.$ and $\left.P_{2}\right)$ resulting in a measured resistance $R=V_{12} / I$. This model describes the 3D ERT forward problem for 25 electrodes in a homogeneous ground of resistivity $100 \Omega \mathrm{~m}$, and compares the result with the analytical solution.

Although technically a low-frequency alternating current is used, inductive and capacitive effects are typically ignored and the governing equation is

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla \cdot(-\sigma \nabla V)=I \cdot\left(\delta\left(\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}_{C 1}\right)-\delta\left(\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}_{C 2}\right)\right) \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Here, $V$ represents the electric potential, $\sigma$ is the subsurface electrical conductivity, and $I \cdot\left(\delta\left(\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}_{C 1}\right)-\delta\left(\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}_{C 2}\right)\right)$ are point current sources from the electrodes located at positions $\mathbf{r}_{C 1}$ and $\mathbf{r}_{C 2}$ (actually, one electrode acts as current source, and the other as current sink).

The goal of ERT method is to determine the unknown subsurface resistivity from measurements with a multitude of electrode configurations, $R\left(C_{1}, C_{2}, P_{1}, P_{2}\right)_{i}$, $i=1, \ldots, N$. The procedure typically involves two steps:

- The prediction of measurement responses on a given model (forward step)
- The correction of the model to achieve a better fit (inverse step)

The procedure is repeated iteratively until an acceptable fit between predicted and measured data and an agreement with additional constraints (for example, smoothness or a priori information) are found.

Whereas the forward step is well defined by Equation 1, many algorithms have been proposed for the inverse step. Most commonly, gradient-based inverse methods are used (Ref. 2), which require the calculation of a parameter sensitivity matrix $S$ that describes how the measured resistance would be affected by the change of a parameter (typically the resistivity in a certain subsurface region).

It can be shown (Ref. 3) that the measured resistance can also be expressed as

$$
\begin{equation*}
R_{i}=\int_{\Omega} S_{i}(\mathbf{r}, \rho) \rho(\mathbf{r}) d V \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

with the sensitivity function $S_{i}$ defined as

$$
\begin{equation*}
S_{i}(\mathbf{r}, \rho)=J\left(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}_{C 1, i}, \mathbf{r}_{C 2, i}\right) \cdot J^{\prime}\left(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{r}_{P 1, i}, \mathbf{r}_{P 2, i}\right) \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

which is given by the reciprocity theorem (Ref. 4). Here, $\mathbf{r}_{C 1}$ and $\mathbf{r}_{C 2}$ are the positions for the electrodes injecting the electric current into the ground, and $\mathbf{r}_{P 1}$ and $\mathbf{r}_{P 2}$ are the position for the electrodes measuring the difference in electric potential $V_{12}$, for a given configuration " $i$ ".

## Model Definition

The model illustrates the forward step and the sensitivity calculation for a typical situation of near-surface ERT with 25 point electrodes spaced one meter from each other. The model is geometrically parameterized to be easily adaptable to various sizes.

At the sides and at the bottom of the domains the infinite element domains account for the fact that the domain is not bounded.


Figure 1: Computational domain. A line of 25 electrodes is placed at the top of a 50-by-50-by-20 meters box bounded by infinite element regions.

As a material, use a homogeneous half-space that often serves as a reference model for forward algorithms. The electric conductivity is $\sigma=0.01 \mathrm{~S} / \mathrm{m}$, which corresponds to a resistivity of $100 \Omega \mathrm{~m}$.

The solution is compared to the analytical solution

$$
\begin{equation*}
V=\frac{I}{2 \pi \sigma}\left(\frac{1}{\left|\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}_{C 1}\right|}-\frac{1}{\left|\mathbf{r}-\mathbf{r}_{C 2}\right|}\right) \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

To achieve sufficient accuracy, the mesh density is refined directly at the electrodes and in the region of particular interest underneath them. A swept mesh is used in infinite element regions; see Figure 2.


Figure 2: Refined mesh around the electrodes and swept mesh in infinite element regions.
Use the continuation solver to switch between different electrode configurations.

## Results and Discussion

Figure 3 shows the potential distribution around the active pair for the second of the two electrode configurations that the model solves for.

Figure 4 compares the simulation results for the potential at the electrode positions for both electrode configurations to the analytical solution given by Equation 4.

Figure 5 shows the relative error of the computed solutions with respect to the analytical solutions given by Equation 4 for the two electrode configurations. The plot is taken along the line joining the point sources.

2: dom_C1 $=39$, dom_C2 $=44$ Surface: Electric potential (V) Contour: Electric potential (V)


Figure 3: Electric potential around the active electrode pair.


Figure 4: Comparison between analytical (lines) and modeled (markers) results.
Relative error between modeled and analytical potential


Figure 5: The relative error of the computed solutions with respect to the analytical solutions for the two electrode configurations. The plot is taken along the line joining the point sources.

The model solves for two current dipole situations with a common midpoint. Together they allow the calculation of the sensitivity of a Wenner- $\alpha$ configuration according to Equation 3.

```
S = with(1,ec.Jx)*with(2,ec.Jx) + with(1,ec.Jy)*with(2,ec.Jy) +
    with(1,ec.Jz)*with(2,ec.Jz))
```

The with operator makes reference to the modeled configuration (1 or 2 in the first argument of the operator). Figure 6 shows a plot of this expression.


Figure 6: Sensitivity plot.

## References

1. F. Wenner, "A Method of Measuring Earth Resistivity," National Bureau of Standards, Bull. 12(4) 258, pp. 478-496, 1915.
2. M. Loke and R. Barker, "Practical techniques for 3D resistivity surveys and data inversion," Geophysical Prospecting, vol. 44, pp. 499-523, 1996.
3. S. Friedel, "Resolution, Stability and Efficiency of Resistivity Tomography Estimated from a Generalized Inverse Approach," Geophys. J. Int., vol. 153, pp. 305316, 2003.
4. D.B. Geselowitz, "An application of electrocardiographic lead theory to impedance plethysmography," IEEE Trans. Biomed. Eng. BME-18, pp. 38-41, 1971.

Model Library path: ACDC_Module/Other_Industrial_Applications/ geoelectrics

## Modeling Instructions

## MODEL WIZARD

I Go to the Model Wizard window.
2 Click Next.
3 In the Add physics tree, select AC/DC>Electric Currents (ec).
4 Click Next.
5 Find the Studies subsection. In the tree, select Preset Studies>Stationary.
6 Click Finish.

## GLOBAL DEFINITIONS

## Parameters

I In the Model Builder window, right-click Global Definitions and choose Parameters.
2 In the Parameters settings window, locate the Parameters section.
3 In the table, enter the following settings:

| Name | Expression | Description |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| L | $50[\mathrm{~m}]$ | Domain length |
| W | $50[\mathrm{~m}]$ | Domain width |
| H | $20[\mathrm{~m}]$ | Domain height |
| WI | $4[\mathrm{~m}]$ | Infinite layer thickness |
| N | 25 | Number of electrodes |
| a | $1[\mathrm{~m}]$ | Electrode separation |
| x0 | L/2-N/2*a | First electrode x-position |
| y0 | $100[\mathrm{~m} / \mathrm{S}]$ | First electrode y-position |
| rho0 | 1 | Resistivity |
| conf |  | Active configuration |


| Name | Expression | Description |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| dom_C1 | 39 | Positive electrode domain <br> number |
| dom_C2 | 44 | Negative electrode domain <br> number |

## GEOMETRY I

Block I
I In the Model Builder window, under Model I right-click Geometry I and choose Block.
2 In the Block settings window, locate the Size and Shape section.
3 In the Width edit field, type L.
4 In the Depth edit field, type W.
5 In the Height edit field, type H.
6 Locate the Position section. In the $\mathbf{z}$ edit field, type $-H$.
7 Click to expand the Layers section. In the table, enter the following settings:

| Layer name | Thickness (m) |
| :--- | :--- |
| Layer 1 | WI |

8 Find the Layer position subsection. Select the Left check box.
9 Select the Right check box.
10 Select the Front check box.
II Select the Back check box.
I2 Click the Build Selected button.
Polygon I
I In the Model Builder window, right-click Geometry I and choose More Primitives>Polygon.

2 In the Polygon settings window, locate the Coordinates section.
3 In the $\mathbf{x}$ edit field, type range ( $\mathrm{x} 0, \mathrm{a}, \mathrm{x} 0+\mathrm{N} * \mathrm{a}$ ).
4 In the $y$ edit field, type $y 0+0 *$ range $(0,1, N)$.
5 In the $\mathbf{z}$ edit field, type $0 *$ range $(0,1, N)$.
6 Click the Build Selected button.

## Block 2

I Right-click Geometry I and choose Block.

2 In the Block settings window, locate the Size and Shape section.
3 In the Width edit field, type ( $N+4$ ) *a.
4 In the Depth edit field, type $(N+4) * a$.
5 In the Height edit field, type $N * a / 3$.
6 Locate the Position section. In the $\mathbf{x}$ edit field, type $\times 0-2 * a$.
7 In the $y$ edit field, type $y 0 / 2-2^{*} a$.
8 In the $\mathbf{z}$ edit field, type $-N * a / 3$.
9 Click the Build Selected button.

## Form Union

I In the Model Builder window, under Model I>Geometry I right-click Form Union and choose Build Selected.

2 Click the Go to Default 3D View button on the Graphics toolbar.
3 Click the Transparency button on the Graphics toolbar to see the interior of the geometry.
The completed geometry is shown in Figure 1.
4 Click the Transparency button on the Graphics toolbar to return to the default state.

## DEFINITIONS

## Analytic I

I In the Model Builder window, under Model I right-click Definitions and choose Functions $>$ Analytic.

2 In the Analytic settings window, locate the Function Name section.
3 In the Function name edit field, type V_ref.
4 Locate the Parameters section. In the Expression edit field, type $1[A] * r h o 0 /$ (2*pi)*(1/abs (x-x1)-1/abs (x-x2)).

5 In the Arguments edit field, type $\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{x} 1, \mathrm{x} 2$.
Later, you will compare the simulation results with the analytical solution given by V_ref.

## Explicit I

I In the Model Builder window, right-click Definitions and choose Selections>Explicit.
2 In the Explicit settings window, locate the Input Entities section.
3 From the Geometric entity level list, choose Boundary.

4 Select Boundaries $1-5,8,10,11,15,17,18,22,23,25,26,28,33,40,45,46$, $54,55,57,62,69$, and $74-81$ only.

5 Right-click Model I>Definitions>Explicit I and choose Rename.
6 Right-click Model I>Definitions>Explicit I and choose Rename.
7 Go to the Rename Explicit dialog box and type Ground boundaries in the New name edit field.

8 Click OK.

## Explicit 2

I Right-click Definitions and choose Selections>Explicit.
2 Select Domains 1-9, 11, 12, and 14-19 only.
3 Right-click Model I>Definitions>Explicit 2 and choose Rename.
4 Right-click Model I>Definitions>Explicit 2 and choose Rename.
5 Go to the Rename Explicit dialog box and type Infinite element domains in the New name edit field.

6 Click OK.

## Explicit 3

I Right-click Definitions and choose Selections>Explicit.
2 Select Domains 1-8, 11, 12, and 14-19 only.
3 In the Explicit settings window, locate the Output Entities section.
4 From the Output entities list, choose Adjacent boundaries.
5 Select the Interior boundaries check box.
6 Right-click Model I>Definitions>Explicit 3 and choose Rename.
7 Right-click Model I>Definitions>Explicit $\mathbf{3}$ and choose Rename.
8 Go to the Rename Explicit dialog box and type Infinite element boundaries in the New name edit field.

## 9 Click OK.

Infinite Element Domain I
I Right-click Definitions and choose Infinite Element Domain.
2 In the Infinite Element Domain settings window, locate the Domain Selection section.
3 From the Selection list, choose Infinite element domains.

## MATERIALS

## Material I

I In the Model Builder window, under Model I right-click Materials and choose Material.
2 In the Material settings window, locate the Material Contents section.
3 In the table, enter the following settings:

| Property | Name | Value |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Electrical conductivity | sigma | $1 /$ rho0 |
| Relative permittivity | epsilonr | 1 |

4 Right-click Model I>Materials>Material I and choose Rename.
5 Go to the Rename Material dialog box and type 100 Ohmm homogeneous in the New name edit field.

6 Click OK.

## ELECTRIC CURRENTS

## Point Current Source I

I In the Model Builder window, under Model I right-click Electric Currents and choose Points>Point Current Source.

2 Select Points 29-54 only.
3 In the Point Current Source settings window, locate the Point Current Source section.
4 In the $Q_{j}$ edit field, type 1*(dom==dom_C1)-1* (dom==dom_C2).
5 Locate the Point Selection section. Click Create Selection.
6 Go to the Create Selection dialog box.
7 In the Selection name edit field, type Point sources.
8 Click the $\mathbf{O K}$ button.

## Ground I

I In the Model Builder window, right-click Electric Currents and choose Ground.
2 In the Ground settings window, locate the Boundary Selection section.
3 From the Selection list, choose Ground boundaries.

MESH I

## Free Tetrahedral I

I In the Model Builder window, under Model I right-click Mesh I and choose Free Tetrahedral.

2 In the Free Tetrahedral settings window, locate the Domain Selection section.
3 From the Geometric entity level list, choose Domain.
4 Select Domains 10 and 13 only.
Size 1
I Right-click Model I>Mesh I>Free Tetrahedral I and choose Size.
2 In the Size settings window, locate the Geometric Entity Selection section.
3 From the Geometric entity level list, choose Point.
4 From the Selection list, choose Point sources.
5 Locate the Element Size section. Click the Custom button.
6 Locate the Element Size Parameters section. Select the Maximum element size check box.

7 In the associated edit field, type 0.05.
Size 2
I Right-click Free Tetrahedral I and choose Size.
2 Select Domain 13 only.
3 In the Size settings window, locate the Element Size section.
4 Click the Custom button.
5 Locate the Element Size Parameters section. Select the Maximum element size check box.

6 In the associated edit field, type 2.

## Swept I

I In the Model Builder window, right-click Mesh I and choose Swept.
2 In the Swept settings window, locate the Domain Selection section.
3 From the Geometric entity level list, choose Domain.
4 Select Domains $4,8,9,12$, and 17 only.
Distribution I
Right-click Model I>Mesh I>Swept I and choose Distribution.

## Swept 2

I In the Model Builder window, right-click Mesh I and choose Swept.
2 In the Swept settings window, locate the Domain Selection section.
3 From the Geometric entity level list, choose Domain.
4 Select Domains 2, 3, 6, 7, 11, 15, 16, and 19 only.

## Swept 3

I Right-click Mesh I and choose Swept.
2 In the Settings window, click Build AII.
3 Click the Go to Default 3D View button on the Graphics toolbar. The resulting mesh is shown in Figure 2.

STUDY I

## Step I: Stationary

I In the Model Builder window, expand the Study I node, then click Step I: Stationary.
2 In the Stationary settings window, click to expand the Study Extensions section.
3 Select the Continuation check box.
4 Click Add.
5 In the table, enter the following settings:

| Continuation parameter | Parameter value list |
| :--- | :--- |
| dom_CI | 3439 |

6 Click Add.
7 In the table, enter the following settings:

| Continuation parameter | Parameter value list |
| :--- | :--- |
| dom_C2 | 4944 |

8 In the Model Builder window, right-click Study I and choose Compute.

## RESULTS

## Electric potential

The default slice plot of the electric potential is useful when checking for general modeling errors. To adapt it for this model, modify it as follows:

I In the Model Builder window, expand the Electric potential node, then click Multislice.

2 In the Multislice settings window, locate the Multiplane Data section.
3 Find the x-planes subsection. In the Planes edit field, type 3.
4 Find the y-planes subsection. In the Planes edit field, type 2.
5 Click the Plot button.
2: dom_C1 $=39$, dom_C2 $=44$ Multislice: Electric potential (V)


Follow the instructions below to create tailored plots for this model.

## DEFINITIONS

View I
I In the Model Builder window, expand the Model I>Definitions node.
2 Right-click View I and choose Hide Geometric Entities.
3 In the Hide Geometric Entities settings window, locate the Geometric Entity Selection section.

4 From the Selection list, choose Infinite element domains.
5 In the Model Builder window, right-click View I and choose Hide Geometric Entities.
6 In the Hide Geometric Entities settings window, locate the Geometric Entity Selection section.

7 From the Geometric entity level list, choose Boundary.
8 From the Selection list, choose Infinite element boundaries.
Start by reproducing the sensitivity plot shown in Figure 6.

## RESULTS

## 3D Plot Group 2

I In the Model Builder window, right-click Results and choose 3D Plot Group.
2 Right-click 3D Plot Group 2 and choose Slice.
3 In the Slice settings window, locate the Expression section.
4 In the Expression edit field, type with (1,ec.Jx)*with(2,ec.Jx)+with(1,ec.Jy)*with(2,ec.Jy)+with(1,ec .Jz)*with (2,ec.Jz).

5 Locate the Plane Data section. From the Plane list, choose zx-planes.
6 From the Entry method list, choose Coordinates.
7 In the y-coordinates edit field, type 252729.
8 Locate the Range section. Select the Manual color range check box.
9 In the Minimum edit field, type-1.0E-4.
10 In the Maximum edit field, type 1.0E-4.
II Click the Plot button.
I2 In the Model Builder window, click 3D Plot Group 2.
I3 In the 3D Plot Group settings window, click to expand the Title section.
14 From the Title type list, choose Manual.
15 In the Title text area, type Sensitivity plot.
16 Right-click 3D Plot Group 2 and choose Rename.
17 Right-click 3D Plot Group 2 and choose Rename.
18 Go to the Rename 3D Plot Group dialog box and type Sensitivity in the New name edit field.

19 Click OK.

## 3D Plot Group 3

I Right-click Results and choose 3D Plot Group.
2 In the Model Builder window, under Results right-click 3D Plot Group 3 and choose Surface.

3 In the Surface settings window, click to expand the Range section.
4 Select the Manual color range check box.
5 In the Minimum edit field, type - 10.
6 In the Maximum edit field, type 10.

7 In the Model Builder window, right-click 3D Plot Group 3 and choose Contour.
8 In the Contour settings window, locate the Levels section.
9 From the Entry method list, choose Levels.
10 In the Levels edit field, type $-10^{\wedge}($ range $(0,-0.2,-3)) 10^{\wedge}(\operatorname{range}(-3,0.2,0))$.
II Locate the Coloring and Style section. From the Coloring list, choose Uniform.
$\mathbf{1 2}$ From the Color list, choose Black.
13 Clear the Color legend check box.
14 Click the Plot button.
15 Click the Go to Default 3D View button on the Graphics toolbar.

## Data Sets

I In the Model Builder window, under Results right-click Data Sets and choose Cut Plane.

2 In the Cut Plane settings window, locate the Plane Data section.
3 From the Plane list, choose zx-planes.
4 In the $\mathbf{y}$-coordinates edit field, type y0.
3D Plot Group 4
I In the Model Builder window, right-click Results and choose 3D Plot Group.
2 In the 3D Plot Group settings window, locate the Data section.
3 From the Data set list, choose Cut Plane I.
4 From the Parameter value (dom_CI,dom_C2) list, choose I: dom_CI=34, dom_C2=49.
5 Right-click Results>3D Plot Group 4 and choose Surface.
6 In the Surface settings window, locate the Range section.
7 Select the Manual color range check box.
8 In the Minimum edit field, type - 10 .
9 In the Maximum edit field, type 10.
10 In the Model Builder window, right-click 3D Plot Group 4 and choose Contour.
II In the Contour settings window, locate the Levels section.
12 From the Entry method list, choose Levels.
13 In the Levels edit field, type $-10^{\wedge}($ range $(0.4,-0.2,-3))$ 10^(range (-3, 0.2, 0.4) ).

14 Locate the Coloring and Style section. From the Coloring list, choose Uniform.

15 From the Color list, choose Black.
16 Clear the Color legend check box.
17 Click the Plot button.
1: dom_C1=34, dom_C2=49 Surface: Electric potential (V)
Contour: Electric potential (V)


I8 In the Model Builder window, click 3D Plot Group 4.
19 In the 3D Plot Group settings window, locate the Data section.
20 From the Parameter value (dom_CI,dom_C2) list, choose 2: dom_CI=39, dom_C2=44.

2I Click the Plot button.
2: dom_C1=39, dom_C2=44 Surface: Electric potential (V)
Contour: Electric potential (V)

$\boldsymbol{2}$ Proceed to reproduce the comparison plot in Figure 4. Begin by adding a Function data set for the analytic solution.

## Data Sets

I In the Model Builder window, under Results right-click Data Sets and choose More Data Sets>Function ID.

2 In the Function ID settings window, locate the Function section.
3 From the Function list, choose Analytic I.
4 Locate the Parameter Bounds section. In the Minimum edit field, type 10.
5 In the Maximum edit field, type 40.

## ID Plot Group 5

I In the Model Builder window, right-click Results and choose ID Plot Group.
2 In the ID Plot Group settings window, click to expand the Title section.
3 From the Title type list, choose Manual.
4 In the Title text area, type Comparison between analytical (lines) and modeled (markers) results.

5 Locate the Plot Settings section. Select the $\mathbf{x}$-axis label check box.
6 In the associated edit field, type Position (m).

7 Select the $\boldsymbol{y}$-axis label check box.
8 In the associated edit field, type Voltage (V).
9 Right-click Results>ID Plot Group 5 and choose Point Graph.
10 In the Point Graph settings window, locate the Data section.
II From the Data set list, choose Solution I.
$\mathbf{1 2}$ From the Parameter selection (dom_CI, dom_C2) list, choose First.
I3 Locate the Selection section. From the Selection list, choose Point sources.
14 Locate the y-Axis Data section. In the Expression edit field, type abs (V).
15 Locate the x-Axis Data section. From the Parameter list, choose Expression.
16 In the Expression edit field, type $x$.
17 Click to expand the Coloring and Style section. Find the Line style subsection. From the Color list, choose Blue.

18 Click to expand the Legends section. In the Model Builder window, under Results>ID Plot Group 5 right-click Point Graph I and choose Duplicate.

19 In the Point Graph settings window, locate the Data section.
20 From the Parameter selection (dom_CI, dom_C2) list, choose Last.
21 Locate the Coloring and Style section. Find the Line style subsection. From the Color list, choose Green.

2 In the Model Builder window, right-click ID Plot Group 5 and choose Line Graph.
$\mathbf{2}$ In the Line Graph settings window, locate the Data section.
24 From the Data set list, choose Function ID I.
$\mathbf{2 5}$ Locate the y-Axis Data section. In the Expression edit field, type abs(mod1.V_ref(s, 17.5,32.5)).
The prefix mod1 instructs COMSOL Multiphysics that this function is defined in Model 1.
$\mathbf{2 6}$ Locate the x-Axis Data section. From the Parameter list, choose Expression.
27 In the Expression edit field, type s.
28 Click to expand the Coloring and Style section. Find the Line style subsection. From the Color list, choose Blue.

29 Right-click Results>ID Plot Group 5>Line Graph I and choose Duplicate.
30 In the Line Graph settings window, locate the y-Axis Data section.
31 In the Expression edit field, type abs (mod1. V_ref (s, 22.5, 27.5) ).

32 Locate the Coloring and Style section. Find the Line style subsection. From the Color list, choose Green.

33 Click the Plot button.
Change to $\log$ scale.
34 Click the $\mathbf{y}$-Axis Log Scale button on the Graphics toolbar.
35 Click the Plot button.

## ID Plot Group 6

Finally reproduce the relative error plots in Figure 5.
I In the Model Builder window, right-click Results and choose ID Plot Group.
2 In the ID Plot Group settings window, locate the Title section.
3 From the Title type list, choose Manual.
4 In the Title text area, type Relative error between modeled and analytical potential.

5 Locate the Plot Settings section. Select the $\mathbf{x}$-axis label check box.
6 In the associated edit field, type Position (m).
7 Select the $\mathbf{y}$-axis label check box.
8 In the associated edit field, type Relative error.
9 Click to expand the Axis section. Select the Manual axis limits check box.
10 Select the $\boldsymbol{y}$-axis log scale check box.
II In the $\mathbf{x}$ minimum edit field, type 12.25.
12 In the x maximum edit field, type 37.75 .
13 In the $\boldsymbol{y}$ minimum edit field, type 1.0e-7.
14 Right-click Results> ID Plot Group 6 and choose Line Graph.
15 In the Line Graph settings window, locate the Data section.
16 From the Data set list, choose Solution I.
$\mathbf{1 7}$ From the Parameter selection (dom_CI, dom_C2) list, choose First.
18 Locate the $\boldsymbol{y}$-Axis Data section. In the Expression edit field, type abs (V-mod1.V_ref(x, 17.5,32.5))/abs(V).

19 Select Edges 67-91 only.
20 Locate the x-Axis Data section. From the Parameter list, choose Expression.
21 In the Expression edit field, type $x$.
$\boldsymbol{2}$ In the Model Builder window, under Results> ID Plot Group 6 right-click Line Graph I and choose Duplicate.

23 In the Line Graph settings window, locate the Data section.
24 From the Parameter selection (dom_CI, dom_C2) list, choose Last.
25 Locate the $\boldsymbol{y}$-Axis Data section. In the Expression edit field, type abs(V-mod1.V_ref(x, 22.5,27.5))/abs(V).

26 Click the Plot button.

